

Child Abuse or Parental Discipline

The State Attorney's Office in Central Florida alleged that in the Summer of 1999 the defendant spanked his 6-year-old daughter. There were no eyewitnesses to the event other than the child and her father. The child sustained dark bruises covering both of her buttocks. She received medical attention at a hospital. Photographs were taken of the child's injuries, showing bruises on the child's buttocks as well as bruising on the child's upper thigh and upper back.

The motive or explanation for the beating was unclear. The State asserted the child had not wiped herself or flushed the toilet after she went to the bathroom, and this angered the parent. The defense argued that the punishment was in response to the child getting into a medicine cabinet, into the father's girlfriend's cigarettes, and pushing her brother.



Know Your Rights

Attorney Jay Howell

The State Attorney's Office charged the defendant/parent with child abuse, alleging he exceeded the bounds of permissible discipline by using excessive force, but agreed his conduct was more the result of a loss of temper than a matter of wilful malice.

Before the trial judge, the defendant argued he was exempt from the crime of "simple child abuse" as long as he was disciplining his child, regardless of his motive. The trial judge agreed and dismissed the charges against him. The State appealed.

The Appellate Court examined the history of the Florida legislature's attempt to

draw a line between parental discipline and criminal behavior. Citing an established common law tradition which permits reasonable parental discipline, the court concluded that current child abuse laws do not exempt parents from prosecution for child abuse, but attempted to find the boundary between permissible parental discipline and prohibited child abuse.

Previous Appellate Court decisions in Florida had recognized the "well established principle" that a parent, or one acting in place of the parents, does not commit a crime by inflicting corporal punishment on a

child subject to his authority, if he remains within the legal limit of that authority. Another Appellate Court in Florida had previously ruled that a mother punishing her 7-year-old son for stealing money from her by hitting him with a belt, leaving bruising on his shoulders, back and arms, was sufficient to sustain a charge of child abuse. In yet another case, the court found a parent who spanked his 8-year-old daughter with a leather belt causing bruising on the buttocks and right hip, was not sufficient to support a felony charge of aggravated child abuse.

In deciding this case, the Appellate Court recognized that drawing a line between prohibited child abuse and permissible corporal punishment, administered by parents who believe in this form of discipline, is not an easy task. Since we live in a state where the common law has now been replaced in large part by statutes, this difficult task is principally a legislative function. Ruling the misdemeanor child abuse charges were appropriate in this case, the Appellate Court reversed the trial judge and stated whether the corporal punishment of the child in this case was excessive enough to become a crime of child abuse was a question of fact for resolution by the jury or judge hearing all the evidence at trial.

The case is State vs. McDonald, and can be found at 785 So. 2nd, 640 (Fla. 2nd DCA 2001).

TUNE IN! CALL IN!

THE JUSTICE COALITION ON THE RADIO
8:00 A.M. DAILY • 1320AM WJGR
FOR MORE INFO, PLEASE CALL 904-645-7511



*Proud to support the
Justice Coalition's
Victim's Advocate*

(904) 398-8601

3802 Beach Boulevard
Jacksonville, Florida 32207

Ginger King, Vice President

WANTED



CYNTHIA CULL

Race: Black Wt.: 130
Sex: Female Violation:
DOB: 7/25/63 Child Neglect
Ht.: 5' 4"

**"Never doubt
that a small
group of
thoughtful
committed
citizens can
change the
world. Indeed,
it's the only
thing that
ever has."**

Margaret Meade

Big Chief's Tire Co., Inc.



**Supports the
Justice Coalition**

Fritz Parman, III, President

5444 Normandy Blvd.
Jacksonville, FL 32205

786-0721